

Report of the Refereeing Commission (translation into English)

Meeting of 24th and 25th May 2003, Lausanne (Switzerland)

Present :

M. Emmanuel Katsiadakis	(GRE) President
M. René Roch	President of the FIE
M. Max Geuter	(GER) (MH)
Mr Arthur Cramer	(BRA) (MH)
Mme Ana Pascu	(ROM)
M. Roberto Costanzo	(ITA)
M. Serge Plasterie	(FRA)
M. Moris Sakhvadze	(GEO)
M. Salah Ferjani	(TUN)
M. George Kolombatovich	(USA)
M. Arthur Bar-Joseph	(ISR)
M. Ken Ichi-Hinoshita	(JPN)

M. Ioan Pop	International Technical Director (present at the end of the second day).
Mlle Claudia Sanchez Urban	Management Assistant

The president of the Commission welcomed members and M René Roch, President of the FIE.

Mr Arthur Cramer asked for a change in the order of the agenda. The other members agreed.

M. Katsiadakis began with item 3 on the agenda.

1– Revision (modification) of the selection list (119 people) of referees for the World Championships and Grand Prix of the FIE

M. Katsiadakis proposed that 30 or 40 referees attend the seminar in Athens. Members agreed to accept referees of a single weapon from smaller countries. After some discussion, suggestion and comments from Committee members, the list was draw up as follows :

	NOMS (51 nations)	PAYS	Fl.	Ep.	Sa.
1	GANA Ahmed	ALG	B	B	
2	GRABSIA Tahar	ALG	B	B	B
3	GROUPIERRE Victor Sergio	ARG	B	A	B
4	TURIACE Sergio	ARG	B	B	B

	NOMS (51 nations)	PAYS	Fl.	Ep.	Sa.
57	OTHMAN Muhannad	IRQ	B	B	B
58	BAR JOSEPH Shay	ISR	B	A	
59	DRAI-LAST SHIRLI	ISR	B	B	
60	KAROLITSKY Alexandre	ISR	B	B	B

5	OSVATH Peter	AUS	B	B	B
6	KNYSCH Irina	AUT	B	B	
7	AKULICH Gennadi	BLR	B		B
8	LOGOTKO Maksim	BLR			B
9	FINARDI Luciano	BRA	B	B	B
10	TROIS DE AVILA Regis	BRA	B	A	B
11	BELMONTE Manuel	CAN	B	A	B
12	BOUNACHADA Ayach	CAN	B	B	B
13	CANTIN Pascal	CAN	B	B	B
14	VIDOSA Christian ***	CAN	A	A	A
15	LOZANO VELANDIA Fabio E.	COL	B	B	B
16	RIVAS Mauricio	COL	B	B	
17	VASQUEZ Rodrigo	CHI	B	B	B
18	CHU Shisheng	CHN	A	B	B
19	LUO Ping Bei	CHN	B	B	B
20	ZHANG Shuangxi	CHN		B	B
21	ZHAO Chuanjie	CHN	B	B	B
22	D'AURE VEGAS Jorge	CUB	A	B	B
23	MOLA FUENTES Walfrido V.	CUB	B		B
24	LAVERDEZA MONTOYA Jose	CUB	B	B	B
25	TANDRON Lam	CUB	B	B	B
26	JANDA Frantisek	CZE	B	B	
27	JOERGENSEN Normann	DEN	B	A	B
28	EL ARABY Tamer Mohamed	EGY	A	B	B
29	EL MOTOWAKEL Mohamed	EGY	B	B	B
30	MOUNIR Ayman	EGY	B	B	B
31	ALVAREZ Jose L.	ESP	B		B
32	ESPERANZA Jesus	ESP	A	B	A
33	FERNANDES Carlos A.	ESP	B	B	B
34	MEDINA MARTINEZ Miguel	ESP	B		B
35	LAUNNE Ari	FIN		B	B
36	BOULANGER Laurent	FRA		B	B
37	GABY Bruno	FRA		B	B
38	HUMBERT Lionel	FRA	A	B	
39	ROUSSEAU Gerard	FRA	A	B	A
40	HUNTER Ian	GBR	B	A	B
41	SMITH Keith	GBR	B	A	B
42	SAKHVADZE David	GEO	B	B	B
43	BUHR Alexander	GER	B		A
44	GRUETZNER Olaf	GER	A	B	
45	LAMMER Dieter	GER	A	B	
46	ROTH Peter	GER	B	B	
47	GEROSSIDERIS Efstathios	GRE	B	B	
48	HATZISSARANTOS Dimitris	GRE	A	B	B
49	IOSSIFIDIS Pavlos	GRE	B	B	
50	LYBEROPOULOS Constantinos	GRE	B	B	
51	LAI Eric Yan	HKG	B	B	B

61	CANNELLA Marco	ITA	B	A	B
62	SIESTO Marco	ITA	A	B	A
63	VIRGILIO Lucio	ITA	A	B	A
64	ZANOTTI Emanuele	ITA	A	B	A
65	EL NAATOR Ammer	JOR	B	B	
66	HASHIMOTO Hiroshi	JPN	B		B
67	HIROOKA Hareo	JPN	B	B	B
68	DO Tae Kwan	KOR	B	B	B
69	KIM Chang Gon	KOR	A		A
70	HUSSIN Wael Ali	KUW	B	B	B
71	MARZOUQ Fahd Al Mutairy	KUW	B	B	B
72	CASTRO Rea Jorge	MEX	B	B	B
73	RIOS RIVERA Juan Carlos	MEX	B	B	B
74	WOLTHUIS Robert	NED	B	A	
75	FAYE Bjorn	NOR	B	A	
76	BRILL Katherine	NZL	B	B	
77	FUENZALIDA Richard	PHI	B	B	B
78	KIELPIKOWSKI Piotr	PHI	B	B	
79	KISIEL Jaroslaw	POL		B	B
80	KRZESINKI Adam	POL	B	B	
81	NOWINOWSKI Dariuzs	POL	B		B
82	MAGALHAES Miguel	POL	B	B	B
83	MACHADO Miguel	POR	B		
84	FLOREA Marius	POR	B		B
85	MOLEA Romika	ROM	B	B	
86	NUTA Emilian	ROM	B	B	A
87	RAIZMAN Alex	ROM	B	B	B
88	BELIKOVA Irina	RSA	B	B	
89	KLIOUCHINE Andrey	RUS	A	B	
90	TSOUKHLO Eugeni	RUS	B	B	B
91	WONG Liang Hun	RUS	B	B	
92	PAPP Zsolt	SIN	B	A	
93	KRALIK David	SUI	B		
94	BARVESTAD Charlotte	SVK	B	B	
95	FENG Cooper	SWE	B	B	B
96	WANG San-Tsai	TPE	B	B	
97	BOUANEN Mohamed	TPE	B	B	
98	ZOUARI Hassen	TUN	B	B	
99	KARAMETE Mehmet	TUN	B	A	
100	YAMAC Haluk	TUR	B	B	
101	GOLUBYTSKY Sergei	TUR	A		B
102	GOUTZAIT Vadim	UKR	B		B
103	COTTON Derek	UKR	B	B	B
104	MARTIN Francisco	USA	B	B	B
105	NAZLYMOV Vitaly	USA	B		B
106	WASHBURN Charles	USA	B	B	
107	LIENDO Juan	VEN	B	B	

52	ERDEY Peter	HUN	A	B	A
53	GATAI Robert	HUN	B	B	
54	HIDASI Jozsef	HUN	A	A	B
55	POURSALMAN Ali Reza	IRI	B	B	B
56	REZAEI Chodrat Allah	IRI	B	B	B

108	MARQUINA Cesar	VEN		B	
109	MORENO E. Jesus	VEN		B	

*** M. Christian Vidosa (CANADA) to be appointed for Grands Prix only

Mme Rezaie Shirin (IRAN) could be added to the list, but this would need the agreement of the Iranian Federation.

M. Arthur Bar-Joseph proposed that the referees who offered no reason for not attending the World Championships should not be appointed for one year to the Grands Prix and World Championships (junior-cadets included).

2.-Appointment of referees for the 2003 World Championships in Havana (Cuba) for submission to the Executive Committee

See attached list

3.- Appointment of referees for the GP competitions – FIE referees and team events for the 2003/2004 season for submission to the Executive Committee

Mr Cramer proposed that all the referees who appeared in the shortlist should be appointed as least once to a Grand Prix.

See attached list.

2nd Day

4.- Approval of the report of the previous meeting held in Lausanne on 1st, 2nd and 3rd November 2002

Mr Cramer remarked that many of the points made in the last report had not been presented to the Executive Committee. He would have wished to have added the compliments paid by M. Katsiadakis concerning his work on the Commission.

A discussion began concerning the two reports presented to the Commission : that of M. Katsiadakis and that of Mr Cramer, in which he emphasised the points which were to be presented to the Executive Committee. **Mr Cramer's report was approved with certain amendments from M. Katsiadakis :**

- Remove the box and underlining from point 9.4 and delete "proposal approved for submission to the Executive Committee"
- Point 15, proposed : "Members discussed...to number the items in the rules (introduction by Mr Cramer) in place of "proposal approved for submission to the Executive Committee" write "the Commission for Refereeing is in favour".
-

5.-Presentation on the numbering of the Rule Book by Mr Arthur Cramer

Mr Cramer presented a document, Rule Book for Competitions, with a numbering system drawn up by himself and explained the procedure which he had followed. The members of the Commission agreed with this system of numbering, but many of them proposed that it be presented to the Rules Committee. Mr Cramer did not agree, as he needed to present the document to the Congress and the Rules Committee would have to study it after that.

6.- Report on the 2003 Junior/Cadet World Championships in Trapani

M. Bar-Joseph, who was the Refereeing Commission's delegate to these championships, thanked his colleagues for their work and congratulated them.

M. Plasterie presented this report and also remarked on the friendliness which was apparent between the Commission's delegates and the referees. He also laid stress on the lack of referees at the time of these championships and noted the overall improvement in the choice of referees for the finals and semi-finals, as there had been many referees from different countries taking part.

M. Bar-Joseph proposed that the Junior World Championships be separated from the Cadets. M. Katsiadakis said that that was impossible for practical and financial reasons.

Some members made corrections to the report, mainly the names and categories of referees. **The report was approved with the corrections and would be presented to the Executive Committee.**

7.- Proposals for the 2003 Congress submitted for consideration by the Commission

PROPOSALS OF THE GERMAN FENCING FEDERATION

2) Refereeing :

In a letter dated 5/2003 the FIE made reference to a fine where a national federation ignores the quotas for referees in a World Cup (cf Rules of Competition o.88). We propose that the total amount of the fine that a national federation must pay following an announcement that there is a lack of referees, should arrive not less than two weeks before the competition or instead be sent directly and immediately to the World Cup organiser's address, by arrangement with him/her.

Reason :

The organisers are responsible for and must ensure a good standard of refereeing . For this reason they need funds well before the tournament in order to be able to recruit sufficient numbers of referees.

View of the Executive Committee : In favour, but the fine to be returned to the FIE if the organiser cannot source a referee from another country.

View of the Commission for Refereeing : In favour, but the money must revert to the organiser to cover expenses defrayed.

PROPOSALS OF THE PRESIDENT, THE BOARD AND THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Amendments appear below in italics and are underlined

Proposal 7 : Article o.68

The refereeing of the World Championships will be undertaken by referees chosen by the Executive Committee of the FIE, at the recommendation of the Commission for Refereeing. The referees' expenses for accommodation and travel will be the responsibility of the Organising Committee which will receive in return, sole rights over how the money will be committed.

Referees must attend the referees' meeting held on the eve of the World Championships

View of the Commission of Referees : In favour

PROPOSALS OF THE FRENCH FENCING FEDERATION

REFEREEING

PROPOSAL

Appointment of referees by national federations where world championships, World Cup competitions or Grands Prix are concerned. If the FIE continues to appoint referees : The International Commission on Refereeing must establish a list of referees based on two per country per weapon, matched to an objective standard measured by the quality of the refereeing shown during a season in which the Executive Committee makes the choice.

REASONS

We are losing our best referees in favour of political appointments and we are favouring arguments for "globalisation" to the detriment of quality. The rule proposed by the FIE's Commission on Refereeing is not being applied : in order to referee the World Championships one must have refereed the final stages of a world cup a minimum of 3 times in the weapon concerned. We would thus avoid the popularity-seeking practised at the moment and the subservience of those of our referees who dare not "cross" "those who make the decisions".

View of the Executive Committee : Not in favour

View of the Commission for Refereeing : Not in favour

PROPOSALS OF THE ISRAELI FENCING FEDERATION

1. The international referees to obtain their grading based on the view of the FIE's Commission for Refereeing in order to be invited to competitions, or under the auspices of other appropriate bodies of the FIE, the classification would be awarded by their national federation. (As happens in football).

2. If the president of the FIE is informed that a referee is the victim of discrimination by his national federation for whatever reason, he would be able to add this referee to a separate list and the referee could be invited to participate in FIE competitions under the FIE banner.
3. Referees who are subjects of a particular country but are not living in that country and whom the Commission for Refereeing are considering for some refereeing activity within the FIE. The Commission for Refereeing will inform the confederation concerned of the intervention in the national classification, and if the national federation wishes, it will have the right to oppose this and to put forward its arguments. The final decision will rest with the Commission for Refereeing.
4. This final decision could go to appeal, like all decisions.

View of the Commission for Refereeing : Not in favour

8.- Reports of the examiners on the refereeing examinations for the season 2002/2003

Various members gave a resume of the examinations where they had been the examiners. M. Katsiadakis remarked that certain computer programmes did not recognise or inverted the date of birth. M. Geuter proposed that, so that these mistakes as well as incorrect spelling of names could be overcome, candidates should send a copy of their passport at the same time as their application.

A number of members emphasised that the fact of having a lot of candidates made the organisation and smooth running of examinations difficult. M. Katsiadakis proposed that the number of candidates be limited to a maximum of 20.

M. Katsiadakis gave an account of the reports sent by M. Geuter concerning the Grands Prix and which gave a clear view of the activity of referees at the time of the tournaments. He recommended that this report be used as a model for the future.

9- Presentation and approval of video cassettes (DVD) for refereeing, POA, seminars etc. (introduction by M. Serge Plasterie)

M. Plasterie showed a video lasting approximately 10 minutes on the explanation of fencing in general with pictures and movements of refereeing, some rules and a little test to help put into practice the knowledge learnt. This video could be used in refereeing examinations, seminars etc. The cost of producing this video is about 1000 euros and was made in three and a half days. Mr Cramer remarked that the blades shown in the video were very bent and that the movements could be improved. The members appreciated the video and congratulated M. Plasterie on his work. They agreed to use it as a tool in refereeing examinations and seminars.

10 – Processing and finalisation of question papers for written examinations in refereeing (introduction by MM Kolombatovich, Cramer and Plasterie)

The question papers were not yet ready. M. Katsiadakis proposed that they should be made ready for the next meeting and he formed a sub-committee (M. Kolombatovich, Cramer, Plasterie at Ferjani) to review the examination system.

Mr Cramer wished the new examination system to use the numbered Rules. The other members did not agree, as the work of the commission needs to continue independently of the numbering of the Rule Book. The system will therefore be reviewed according to the current Rule Book.

11- Corrections to the general list of FIE referees

M. Costanzo put forward several corrections to be made by the Lausanne office concerning the Italian referees.

Members agreed to remove from the list persons aged 60 or more.

M. Katsiadakis proposed that only referees who held a licence valid for the current season should appear on the list.

M. Roch proposed that there should be honorary referees : those who were on the list but who do not hold a valid licence and active referees : those who hold a licence valid for the current season.

12- Any other business

- Proposal by Mr Cramer concerning the Rule Book : He asked that the same principles be adopted for pools as for other matches (e.g.) concerning the absence of a fencer from the piste. Where terminology is concerned, usual terms should be defined and examples be given in the Rule Book. He asked members to give examples of incorrect terminology in order to enrich the text. He said that it was also important to penalise from the outset the worst fault and send a signal that this course of action was approved by the Executive Committee. The position of “point en ligne” must be defined and a drawing made of it for inclusion into the Rule Book.
- Letter from fencer Paolo Milanoli : he asked what happens if there is passiveness during a team match? The Commission said that that the rules governing individuals must be adapted to the rules for teams. This must be discussed with the Executive Committee.
- Concerning examinations for referees : there would be no refereeing examinations before the Olympic Games. M. Pop remarked that the level of refereeing examinations was very low and that there was also a communication problem owing to the language which examinees did not always understand. M. Roch recalled that he had proposed that examinations should be held in Lausanne and that it was essential that they be as objective as possible.

The Hungarian Federation : proposed that M. Gergacz Laszlo and Toth Ferenc be awarded a category A pass in sabre. The Commission were not in favour at this time.

After having covered all the items on the agenda, M. Katsiadakis thanked the members of the Commission and closed the meeting at 5 p.m.

